

---

LOS ANGELES –  
Wednesday, October 15, 2014 – 16:00 to 17:30  
ICANN – Los Angeles, USA

## TRANSCRIPT

### ccNSO Council Meeting Los Angeles

#### Attendees:

##### AF:

Souleymane Oumtanaga, .ci  
Vika Mpisane, .za  
Abibu Ntahigiye, tz

##### APTLD:

Keith Davidson, .nz  
Hiro Hotta, .jp

Young-Eum Lee, .kr

##### EU:

Lesley Cowley  
Nigel Roberts, .gg & .je  
Katrina Sataki, .lv

##### LAC:

Victor Abboud, .ec  
Demi Getschko, .br  
Margarita Valdes, .cl

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

**NA:**

Byron Holland, .ca  
Dotty Sparks de Blanc, .vi

**Observers:**

Carolina Aguerre, LACTLD (telephone)  
Maureen Hillyard, At-Large observer to the ccNSO  
Barrack Otieno, AfTLD

**ICANN Staff:**

Bart Boswinkel  
Kristina Nordstrom  
Gabiella Schitteck

**Apologies:**

Don Hollander, APTLD  
Jordi Iparraguirre, NomCom appointee  
Celia Lerman Friedman, NomCom appointee  
Peter Van Roste, CENTR  
Hong Xue, NomCom appointee

Byron Holland: Okay, everybody. Let's take our seats, get comfortable. Hello? Hello? Can you hear me down at the other end?

Unidentified Recipient: No. (Inaudible).

Byron Holland: Can you hear me now?

---

Unidentified Recipient: Yeah.

Byron Holland: Okay, well, I'd like to call the Council Meeting of October 15th, to order. Welcome everybody to the ICANN 51 Council Meeting. As you can see from the agenda it is fulsome to say the least. So I'll certainly encourage any discussion that people would like to have, but also try to be as efficient as possible. Gaby, do we have any apologies.

Gabriela Schittek: Yes, we have apologies from Peter Van Roste, Jordi Iparraguirre, Hong Xue, Carolina Aguerre, Don Hollander and Celia Lerman Friedman; although I can see that Peter, Jodi and Carolina are following us through Adobe Connect.

Byron Holland: Thank you very much. The minutes from the previous meeting have been circulated. I hope you all had time to review them. Were there any corrections, issues, errors, comments on the minutes? Okay. Seeing none, we'll take them as approved. And then we'll just say once again, we have a very long, straight table which is a challenge when you are the Chair in the middle of it. So, please if I don't happen to see you or catch your eye, wave, or make yourself known if you have if you want to make an intervention. Thank you.

Gabi, actions?

Gabriela Schittek: That's for Kristina.

Kristina Nordstrom: All actions have been completed, I don't know if you want to hear them.

---

Byron Holland: That's great. Thank you. Well done everybody. No outstanding actions. Item number three is the adoption of the Council of Election Report. Oh, given the number of agenda items we have here, I'm not going to review the background, you have it front of you. You've had it as part of your agenda. If there's any discussion we'll take it with the resolution, but I'm not going to go through the background that you have in front of you. So in terms of the election report, we do have a draft resolution, although how I'd like to do this, it's we'll make a motion on the resolutions, and then we can have discussion after that, and then a vote; so just in terms of process.

So the draft resolution which I will read for the record is, "The ccNSO Council adopts the election report for the Council elections 2015, and thanks, Gaby, for her hard work as the Elections Process Manager. The ccNSO congratulates the elected candidates, and notes that they will take their seat at the end of the ccNSO Meeting, at the February ICANN Meeting." Can I get somebody to make a motion for that? Lesley, and Demi seconding it. Thank you very much. Any discussion on that motion? Lesley?

Lesley Cowley: Thank you, Byron. It's miles away -- In the session we've had with the candidates and the Board candidates, I heard concerns around there not being a competitive election, so I would like to suggest an expansion to the resolutions really to ask the Council to consider that further, about how -- for the new time round, we can have a more competitive process, and hopefully encourage more people to stand for both the Board and the Council places. I think we have a work item there.

Byron Holland: So just to be clear, you are suggesting a friendly amendment here that would add some language to the existing resolution?

Lesley Cowley: I am. I'm suggesting we have -- that hearing the community concerns, the Council will look further into how we can best encourage more candidates to stand next year.

Byron Holland: Thank you. Any further comment or discussion on that?

---

Nigel Roberts: I second it.

Byron Holland: Okay, we have a seconder with Nigel. Bart?

Bart Boswinkel: May I suggest to Council, that they consider this as well as part of, I think agenda item, blah-di-blah.

Lesley Cowley: You have agenda item 15 which you could add it to, but it didn't necessarily seem to apply.

Bart Boswinkel: No, but refer in that agenda item to this one as well, or the other way around, which is on--

Byron Holland: I'm sorry. Which agenda item?

Bart Boswinkel: Fifteen.

Lesley Cowley: But because I thought that was primarily around procedural guidelines, it wouldn't necessarily expand to other participation.

Byron Holland: I would tend to agree with that. Are there any -- is there any further discussion around adding the verbiage for the friendly amendment as suggested by Lesley? No? Okay. Can I call for a vote? Everybody in favor of the resolution with the wording as proposed by Lesley, regarding enhancing our efforts to encourage other people -- or more people to participate in the process? All in favor? I'm going to need help on this. It's challenging to see. Any--

---

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: That would be great. Please do. Excellent, innovate suggestion, very internet worthy. I think to boot this long table is almost curved slightly backwards too. I'll just let Keith take a seat and then carry on. Was there anybody opposed to that? Anybody abstaining from that? Okay. Thank you.

Item number four, Board member selection, again I won't read the background, it should be relatively fresh in our memory, so I hope that everybody recalls yesterday's conversation. I will read the draft resolution for the record, which is, "The ccNSO Council adopts the selection report for the Board C12 selection process, and thanks Gaby for her hard work as Election Process Manager. The ccNSO Council selects Mike Silver to fill ICANN Board seat number 12, starting at the end of ICANN's Annual General Meeting in 2015, for a term of three years."

The Council requests this Chair to inform the ICANN Secretariat accordingly, and Council congratulates Mike on his nomination and selection and expresses deep appreciation for his services to date on the ICANN Board of Directors.

That's the resolution. Can I get a motion for that? Nigel. Seconder? Katrina, Young-Eum was quicker on the draw. Thank you. Any discussion on this? Seeing none, a call for a vote. All in favor? Thank you. Any opposed? Abstaining? Okay. Thank you. Resolution carried.

Agenda item number five, the Cross Community Working Group on Internet Governance, something that has been on our agenda before, and we are going to get it done at this meeting. That is the appointment of members, a number of members -- we sent out a call for volunteers and got a number of members, we have a draft resolution which identifies those members, and the draft resolution is, which I'll read for the record, "ccNSO Council appoints the following volunteers to the CCWGIG, Erik Iriarte, Vika Mpisane, and Jörg Schweiger." Sorry if I'm butchering people's names.

---

The Council requests the Secretariat to inform the Co-Chairs of the CCWG of the appointment of these members. Can I get a motion for that, please? Keith first, Katrina second. Thank you.

Any discussion on this resolution? Seeing none, a call for a vote. All in favor of this resolution? All in favor of this resolution? Unanimous. Thank you. Item 5.1 completed, motion carried -- resolution carried, rather.

5.2 relates to the appointment of the Co-Chair to the CCWGIG, and the draft resolution reads as follows, "The ccNSO Council appoints Jordan Carter from Dot.NZ, as Co-Chair of the CCWGIG, and requests him to regularly attend the ccNSO Council meetings, specifically for the related part on the agenda to liaise between then CCWG and the Council. The Secretary is requested to inform the CCWGIG leadership and support staff of Jordan's appointment, and the Secretariat is requested to ensure Jordan is invited timely -- in a timely manner. Can I get somebody to make a motion on that? Katrina.

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: I think there was a seconder down there, who is -- (inaudible) solid in that way.

Unidentified Recipient: Young-Eum.

Byron Holland: Young-Eum, thank you. Any discussion on this item? Young-Eum, I think -- sorry I can't -- Please, go ahead.

Young-Eum Lee: Thanks. Thanks, Byron. I'm Young-Eum, (inaudible), I would just like to make sure that Jordan was notified and has accepted. Okay. Great. And I would just like to -- I mean -- I think

---

this was an excellent choice on our part, but I was -- I'm just curious how -- I mean what the process was to select, and I think this question goes to the appointment of Chairs for all other groups as well.

Byron Holland: I think with Jordan, first off, his interest was expressed, so that was a key component. He has been with a group since its inception back before Singapore, and was very interested in and committed to the Chair -- the group -- the work of the group itself, and as such was proposed as the Chair for that group.

Young-Eum Lee: Right. Do we --

Byron Holland: Go ahead.

Young-Eum Lee: Young-Eum again, the reason I'm asking is because I noticed that Lisa (ph) had to step down as Chair or -- not this group, but I mean, and this question is for the Chairs of -- or the other cross community working groups, and she had to step down as Chair for the cross community working group on names of territories, and because she was appointed to become a member of another working -- cross community working group, that was a IANA transition, and I think she was also selected or proposed as -- to become a Co-Chair of that group as well. So, I was just wondering how everything, kind of, was discussed and how everything was determined as well? And not just for this group, but for all the other groups as well. Thanks.

Byron Holland: Lesley?

Lesley Cowley: I would suggest as a general matter, maybe that's an issue we could look at document in item 15, that Bart was directing me too, earlier, where it could be -- we could much better clarify how the processes work, but currently we apply, or indeed change them.

---

Byron Holland: Thank you. If we could take a specific issue to item 15, we can add it to that process, if we so desire at that point, and we can have further discussion about the individual proposals for Chair, as we come to those items. So I take your point Young-Eum, but have that conversation when we get to those specific items. Did we vote on that? We did vote on that.

Unidentified Recipient: No.

Byron Holland: No. Not yet. Okay. That was just simply the discussion. Is there any further discussion on this item? And then I will call for a motion on that -- or I call for a vote on that, rather, on that resolution? All in favor? Unanimous. Thank you. Congratulations Jordan. I look forward to hearing your reports.

Item number 53, which I think was an additional item not in the original agenda, a draft resolution, I read it for the record, "The Secretariat is requested to draft the charter for adoption by the Council, and in close collaboration with the appointed members of the CCWGIG, to transform the Ad Hoc Group into a Standing Committee focused on Internet Governance, excluding ICANN's Accountability enhancement and IANA Stewardship Transition processes."

So this is really just to take something we already had, which was in the form of a study group, an Ad Hoc Study Group, and formalize it into a working group. Can I have a motion on that resolution, please? Margarita and -- thank you. Any discussions on this resolution? No? Thank you. Okay. We'll call for a vote on the Resolution 53. All in favor? Unanimous approval for 53. Thank you very much.

Moving on to number six, administrative matters relating to the SOP; most of us, I think, would have heard Giovanni's presentation this morning, which I think accurately summed up the background. There is a draft resolution that the Secretariat is requested to invite the current membership to indicate whether they want to stay on as member, taking into account the aforementioned criteria. After completion of this review the Secretariat is requested to send out a call for volunteers including the proposed requirements; and the ccNSO Council will appoint or reappoint members of the SOP Working Group at its first meeting after the call for volunteers has been concluded.

---

The ccNSO Council requests Giovani Sepia, the current Interim Chair, to remain Interim Chair until the new membership of the SOP Working Group has nominated a Chair and this person is appointed by Council. Could I get a motion on that, please? Lesley--

Unidentified Recipient: And Dotty.

Byron Holland: Lesley and Dotty, thank you very much. Any discussion on this resolution?

Keith Davidson: The typo in the second line, they want to stay on as member; it should be members, so a friendly amendment.

Byron Holland: Yes. Thank you. And actually while we are at it, in the third paragraph it's meeting with two Es not just one. Okay. Any other discussion? No? Okay. All in favor of this resolution? Unanimous. Thank you -- thank you very much.

Keith Davidson: I was looking to see if (inaudible).

Byron Holland: Okay. Item number seven, appointing a member to the Council Triage Committee. As I think we know, Hong is stepping down and we need to replace her on the Triage Committee, so the Draft Resolution is, the ccNSO Council appoints Celia Lerman Friedman, a NomCom appointee, as a member of the ccNSO Council Triage Committee, and thanks Hong Xue for her contributions to the Triage Committee. Can I get a motion on this, please? Nigel?

Nigel Roberts: (Inaudible)

---

Byron Holland: Nigel and Young-Eum? Okay. Thank you. I'm just going to let you do that actually, I'm not -- I'll wait to hear from you. Thank you. Any discussion on Resolution number 7? Young-Eum, please go ahead.

Young-Eum Lee: Thanks, Byron. Just a question. So this Triage Committee assumes that a NomCom appointee -- I mean, there may be no formal requirements that are -- because it was desirable that a NomCom Appointee become a member of the Triage Committee, was that the reason for Celia being nominated? Just a question. Thanks.

Byron Holland: Sorry. I didn't catch just the last part of it, could you just pose it -- your question was Celia there just because she's a NomCom appointee?

Young-Eum Lee: I mean -- yes, I mean, not just because but -- I mean, of course she would have more than enough credentials, but because she's taking the place of Hong Xue is that -- I mean, was there a linkage between Hong Xue being a member of the NomCom appointee, and Celia being a member of the NomCom appointee. And again, this is just a question?

Byron Holland: In short, the answer is, no. She, yeah, she volunteered to do the work, that was the -- that was the rationale. It had nothing to do with her NomCom status one way or the other.

Young-Eum Lee: An additional question, Byron?

Byron Holland: Please go ahead.

Young-Eum Lee: I mean but -- and so the additional question is, do we, maybe, assume that -- I mean, is there an assumption that a NomCom appointee be a member of the Triage Committee is a very

---

-- I mean, having at least one member is a desirable sort of structure of the Triage Committee, or is just because of her individual credentials? Thanks.

Byron Holland: The selection of Hong and Celia was because of their willingness and interest to participate, and the work that they have done and will do. It didn't have anything to do with the NomCom -- how they got to this Council.

Young-Eum Lee: Okay. Thanks.

Byron Holland: Thank you. To call for a vote on -- actually sorry -- is there any other discussion on this? No? Okay. I'll call for a vote. All in favor? Unanimous. Thank you.

Item number eight. Appointment of the Co-Chair on the Cross Committee Working Group, use of names, of country and territory as TLDs, the draft resolution; that the ccNSO Council appoints

Annebeth Lange as one of the two ccNSO appointed Co-Chairs. The Secretary is requested to inform the other Co-Chairs and the members of the UCTN accordingly. Can I get a motion for that?

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: Hiro and Katrina, thank you. Any discussion on this resolution? No? In that case I'll call for a vote. All in favor of this resolution?

Unidentified Recipient: Unanimous.

---

Byron Holland: Unanimous. Thank you very much. Congratulations, Annebeth. Thank you. Item number nine -- actually sorry, just before I go to item number nine, I think it would also be appropriate to say thank you to Lise for the work that she's done in the interim there.

Item number nine; the adoption of the framework of Interpretation Working Group, final report; the draft resolution is long but I would like read it into the record, so please bear with me. This is a significant, a very significant piece of work and it's certainly worthy of being read into the record. "The ccNSO Council notes and welcomes the exemplary long and intensive consultation efforts and process the FOIWG went through to gather input and feedback from the community. The ccNSO Council requests the Chair of the ccNSO, and the Chair of the FOIWG to work with the Chair of the Government to Advisory Committee, and interested GAC members to actively seek GAC support for the FOI prior to sending the FOI to the ICANN Board for its adoption, at the next ICANN meeting in February 2015. Until such time --"

Unidentified Recipient: Would you like a friendly amendment?

Byron Holland: Yes.

Unidentified Recipient: Make its position clear.

Byron Holland: Yes. Thank you. "Until such time as the GAC makes its position clear, the ccNSO Council expresses its interim support of the following: (1) the framework of interpretation as included in the final report of the FOIWG. (2) The recommendations included in the final report of the FOIWG; and (3) that these resolutions be published as soon as possible."

Nigel Roberts: (Inaudible)

---

Byron Holland: Thank you, Nigel. A friendly amendment, "At the latest, at the next ICANN meeting, the ccNSO Council will take a definite decision. Finally, the ccNSO Council wholeheartedly thanks and congratulates all who participated in the process with the results. In particular, the Chair of the FOIWG, Keith Davidson, from Dot.NZ, and the members of the WG, and all the members of the community, and ICANN staff and contractors, who were involved in this long and often challenging effort."

Can I get a motion on this, please? Young-Eum and Lesley. Okay. Thank you. Any discussion on this resolution? Nigel?

Nigel Roberts: Excuse me. If Keith is not going to say anything, I just want to make a brief comment. The final report of the Interpretation Working Group is a culmination of a significant period of work, we all know what's been involved. It provides the community, to a greater depth than ever before, details of the construction of RFC 5091, perhaps the most fundamental documents for delegation of ccTLDs. It's been a privilege for me, personally, to be a part of this, and I commend it to Council for its approval.

Byron Holland: Thank you, Nigel. Keith.

Keith Davidson: I would just like to express my reservation of that being noted to be particularly thanked, because I think it is the combined efforts of the fantastic working group who came together and indicated that there was going to be an extremely trying ordeal for us all, but I think we adopted a spirit of cooperation, and I think I don't want to be specified in particular because we all worked hard to get this done. Thank you.

Byron Holland: Could I make a suggestion that perhaps we leave the resolution as is, but for the record, could you please identify all the members of your working group?

Keith Davidson: All of them?

---

Byron Holland: The country code operations.

Keith Davidson: Oh, then, I'll move to thank the -- in particular, all the ccTLDs and members of the Working Group, and the support from staff and contractors -- .

Byron Holland: Thank you. Any further discussion on this? Okay. Well, let's vote on the draft resolution. All in favor? Unanimous. Well done.

(Applause)

A remarkable piece of work; and remarkable endurance. Item number 10. Lesley?

Lesley Cowley: Right. I'd just like to suggest that we share the wording of that resolution particularly with the GAC.

Byron Holland: Indeed. Yes. Okay. Item number 10, which is the IANA Stewardship Transition process, just a verbal update? Keith, would you like to take that on?

Keith Davidson: I'm happy to take that on from an ICG perspective, and a report that there was a conference call just prior to us coming here, and really that was to finalize things for the meeting this year on Friday, so the next significant piece of activity is actually yet to come rather than anything I can currently report on.

Byron Holland: Thank you. And I can probably stop for a brief update on the CWG IANA. Having been the Co-Chair of the Drafting Team, and the Temporary Co-Chair for the first couple of meetings, that working group has been constituted, it had a first -- a conference call last week, which was primarily

---

discussion issues of process and formation. And then as a number of you will have participated in, there was the first face-to-face meeting on Monday, where we tried to work through some more process issues, as well as talked about scope and trying to bring all of the members to a common understanding of what's required, what's the scope, what are the relevant documents, et cetera.

And also work through some of the logistics and a commitment by all members to participate in a two-hour call every week, as well as review significant documentation to get up to speed. So that process is certainly well underway, and a significant effort for those involved. Any discussion on this issue, questions? It's been pretty well discussed over the last few days? Okay. Thank you.

Item number 11, which, I'd say we've probably covered just now -- and that the only thing I would say, is there any other ICG or CWG members who want to make any comment? No? Vika?

Vika Mpisane: Just a notion that is (inaudible) that they are on during the discussion -- the panel discussion spirit, the five ccNSO members that are in -- that I also mention tomorrow, to discuss, especially some of the positions and principles that flew out of the recent panel we had. Yeah.

Byron Holland: Great, thanks. It's very encouraging; you are already self-organizing to work together on this issue. Thank you, Vika.

Item number 12, the appointment of Co-Chair of the CWG IANA Stewardship Transition proposal, something I have to say, I just colloquially refer to as the CWG/IANA. There probably is a little bit of background that is relevant here during the drafting process and the organization of the working group itself, it was agreed upon among the various communities that are participating here, that given the nature of this discussion and the role that the GNSO and ccNSO played in the formation of this endeavor, and the fact that we, collectively, are the directly affected parties in the naming space, that the ccNSO and the GNSO would hold the Co-Chair positions -- the two Co-Chair positions, we would get one each. So that's how this came to be, and that's why the ccNSO actually has this opportunity.

---

That said, with the draft resolution in front of us, the ccNSO Council appoints Lise Fuhr from Dot DK (ph) as Co-Chair of the CWG to develop an IANA Stewardship Transition proposal related to the naming-related function. The ccNSO Council requests this Chair to inform the other chartering organizations, and the other Co-Chairs of the CWG accordingly. The ccNSO Council requests Lise to regularly attend the ccNSO Council meetings, in particular for the related part of the meeting, to liaise between the CWG and the Council, and the Secretariat is requested to ensure Lise is invited in a timely manner.

Can I get a motion on that, please?

Keith Davidson: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: Thank you, Keith and Vika. Any discussion? Hearing none, I'll call for a vote on this resolution. All in favor? Unanimous. Thank you very much. And having chaired the first face-to-face meeting with this group, good luck.

Number 13, enhancing ICANN's Accountability process -- progress, accountability process update. It's in process? Does anybody want to deliver that one?

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: Yeah. Then I will -- I will take a stab at that. I think it -- you know, there's been significant discussion since the weekend, main forums, certainly Fadi and Steve Crocker, our discussions in GAC, and at the Board level, and the main session on Monday afternoon. I think we've just talked about this in detail, and started to clarify it for the community. But in a sense, from what we understand, that while this will be one process, there essentially will be two tracks; one track specific and germane to IANA-related issues, and one that is probably longer in duration related to overall ICANN accountability issues.

---

There is another session on this particular topic tomorrow morning, 9:00, which will probably be informative given that the community has had a number of days to wrestle with it and immerse themselves in it. Though I think probably the good news, and deserves to be recognized is that ICANN made significant change to their initial proposal or straw man, and has listened to the community, and for the most part, I think has reflected the views of the community in how the structure and process how we should work. Bart?

Bart Boswinkel: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: That's right. That's what I mean with the potential drafting team from all of the various constituency groups that are participating in it. Thank you, good point. Any further discussion on that? Okay.

Item number 14. Appointment of ccNSO members to the CWG Accountability Drafting Team, the draft resolution is, "The ccNSO Council appoints the following volunteers as members and alternate to the Drafting Team to establish the CCWG on enhancement of ICANN's accountability. There are two members, Becky Burr and Mathieu Weill, and then alternate, Dina Beer.

Can I get a motion on this, please? Katrina and Keith. Thank you. Any discussion on this resolution? No? Seeing none, then I'll call for a vote. All in favor?

Unidentified Recipient: Unanimous.

Bart Boswinkel: Unanimous. Thank you very much. Item number 15, guidelines and process review committee. There's a draft resolution. To read for the record, the Secretariat is requested to draft the charter for ccNSO Guideline and Process Review Committee, for adoption by the Council at its next meeting. The purpose of the committee should be to review the current guidelines whether they reflect

---

current practices and working methods, assess potential gaps, and based on this analysis, the proposed changes to the current guidelines. The draft charter should also include a proposal for membership.

Can I get a motion on that, please? Katrina and Demi, thank you. Any discussion on this resolution?  
Lesley?

Lesley Cowley: Given, I made the point that that was all about processes earlier, is that also an opportunity to think about our accountability back to the community? Or would that actually be a separate issue?

Byron Holland: Keith?

Keith Davidson: I think even adding to Lesley's comment, you know, we are 10 years old as a community, so perhaps, you know, the first -- or that the best thing we could do is actually have a real visit on our reason for being and our roles and so on; so a ccNSO plus 10, to use the (inaudible) jargon. Would that be appropriate? I mean I know we are in overload now, but as something that we might head towards once we clear the decks of it, so we can make this as a stage of that?

Lesley Cowley: I wasn't quite going that far, because I think there's another ccNSO review in the same way that we had done three, four years ago, that will come up. Maybe we ought to check on the timing of that first.

Keith Davidson: That sounds reasonable.

Byron Holland: We should check on that, because there is one although I can't think what the date would be. And certainly just as a general response to your comment, I think it's entirely appropriate that sometime in the not too distant future we should reflect upon -- or actually who we initially envisioned

---

ourselves, and are there any gaps, and what could we do going forward? However, I think we should wait till we get a couple of these major pieces of work behind us, and not just add on to what is already an exceptionally full dance card.

Lesley Cowley: Unless you are going to come up for time then, Keith.

Keith Davidson: No chance. Just following up, there was a comment earlier -- or two comments earlier referring to maybe making some amendment to this resolution to achieve some other aspect (inaudible). Has anyone worked on wording for those amendments, or is it reasonably covered in what we are considering?

Byron Holland: Lesley, or Young-Eum, or any--

Lesley Cowley: My view was that I think the issue around how people get appointed to working group should be covered by this. Young-Eum, you know, may differ.

Young-Eum Lee: My comment about this is that I think, so far, the elections already have -- I mean, I agree wholeheartedly with the proposed elections, but sometimes I would like to have had a -- have contributed to the selection, and then I would feel a lot more confident and feel better about that (inaudible).

Byron Holland: Could I suggest that somebody propose a friendly amendment to--?

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: Okay. Before I finish my sentence, Bart, did you have something to add?

---

Bart Boswinkel: They should own, what is meant by the guidelines. One of the guidelines is in fact the whole mechanism around working groups. How they are established, how people are appointed, et cetera, and given that we have changed our practices over time, this is one of the parts that needs to be revisited that includes selection and appointment of members, and how you want to deal with it.

Byron Holland: Okay. So what you are saying just to be clear; is that the word guidelines, the guidelines themselves actually include it?

Bart Boswinkel: Yes.

Byron Holland: So essentially we are covered.

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah. And especially with the reference to working methods and practices that have evolved in 2008, so one of the -- what initiated this thinking was in fact the whole selection mechanism first with the members only ICG, and secondly with the Cross Community Working Group as we do not have a set procedure around working groups, how we appoint them. It has grown over time, and therefore is not documented.

Byron Holland: Great. Thank you. So I think we are covered based on that, and thank you, Young-Eum, for raising the issue and helping us clarify it. Lesley, does that deal with your question then?

Lesley Cowley: I think, absolutely. That's why I referred it to the ICANN, yeah.

Byron Holland: Okay. Thank you. Then I'll call for a vote on this resolution. All in favor? Thank you everybody. Okay. Moving on to Council updates. If we could try to keep them relatively brief. As the

---

Chair, I have been to the IGF in Istanbul, last week, actually hosted the Canadian Internet Forum, which is our domestic version. And had been participating in the SO/AC Chair and Leadership calls and meetings every Friday; prior to an ICANN meeting there is a face-to-face working session, which is primarily just an exchange of information in terms of what's happening in the various communities and any of the potentially hot topics for the coming week.

And an attempt to coordinate activities, if there is any relevant place if that can be accomplished. But primarily just an exchange of views and activities, and what our communities are doing in the coming week in particular. Vice Chairs?

Unidentified Recipient: Well, on Monday Gabi and I went to the meeting with Mark and Chris from ICANN regarding the website of ccNSO. The idea is to do some face lift, work on the content, and we desperately need the content management system, because currently all the updates to the website have to be sent to ICANN Tech Department for implementation. We want something that could give us the tool to do quick updates. So at this moment looks quite positive, we have to look into what we want and start working on the website. And I think at some point we'll need to have a call for volunteers to this group.

Byron Holland: Keith?"

Keith Davidson: My take is it has been almost totally on the final stages of the FOI, and the IANA Transition group. So we are out of the -- and I think I've already reported in on those, so other than that, it's just been barely tolerant.

Byron Holland: Thanks. Any counselor updates? Lesley?

Lesley Cowley: And they are (inaudible) short, but can I just make a few minutes. So people might know that I left Nominet in July, and it hasn't been possible to update counselors or the ccNSO, in fact, about

---

what I was doing next, until the announcements have been made public. But I thought it might be helpful just to cover that and put it on the record. So I am pursuing what's known as a portfolio career, which is a grand name for a collection of part-time jobs. They are primarily Board roles, so some of you may have seen this week, that I will be Chair of the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency in the U.K. This is a Government-Agency appointment, and it runs a registry.

Rather, a big registry of 82 million driver and vehicle records, and in that role, obviously, I'll be leading their Board, and it may be of interest to the ccNSO in time, how registries outside of the DNS work (inaudible). I will also be a member of a company called AQL, which is a U.K. telecoms and mobile messaging business. And I will also be doing a Board member role for a cyber security organization in the U.K., but that's not yet been confirmed. But again, that probably will be very relevant for this space.

The U.K., like many governments, has a growing interest in cyber security. I will also be a volunteer panel member. I've been appointed by the Deputy Prime Minister for a review of U.K. surveillance legislation; particularly how to balanced privacy with national security, and I will be doing DNS Women, still, which is networking and support for women in this industry.

And finally, if I have any spare time, we'll be doing some consultancy for a company called Architella (ph) that I know some of you have worked with, and that provides consultancy to gTLDs and ccTLDs on strategy and so on. I'm particularly aware that the last role might possibly result in some conflicts of interests, and I'm very aware of that, and obviously would like to say that if that is the case, then I would declare that interest, and withdraw from discussion.

But like Young-Eum, in fact, when I joined the council, I was a ccTLD employee, even though elected in a personal capacity, but that's obviously no longer the case. I would like to say, however, that I do remain both connected and committed to the ccNSO space, the ccTLD community. And certainly I've had some discussions with Byron about how I can continue to be involved, and how that is going to work with the rest of my portfolio. I'm not sure yet how it's going to work. But I really wanted to put all of that information out there. I'm very happy to take questions or comments either here, or offline?

---

Byron Holland: Thank you, Lesley. On that note are there any questions or comments on this subject, in Lesley's disclosure. Young-Eum?

Young-Eum Lee: Yes. Thank you, Byron, and thank you for -- Lesley, for sharing your -- sharing with us information about your status. I think that there has been some discussion, and I'm very glad to hear you explain your position, relatively clearly. I would just like to be -- I mean, I would like -- just like to make sure that what I've heard from you saying that Nominet is supporting you representing the European region, and if that is so, I mean, I think we would all -- most of us, at least, will be very supportive behind you. No. I didn't say that Nominet was supporting that. To be frank, I haven't asked them if they supported that or not.

Byron Holland: Any other comments. I will just follow up with the notion that I did raise this directly with Lesley because conflict is both potentially real but certainly far more often, it's the perception that is the challenge, and full and frank, and transparent disclosure I think is the most efficient way to mitigate any perception of conflict. I feel that Lesley has done that at this point, She is going to continue to think through whether, given her portfolio of activities, that the demand of the ccNSO, will fit into that, and she'll be able to commit the level of work and effort that she always has, so that's bit of an ongoing discussion, but thank you for being so frank in your disclosure at this point.

Any other counselor updates that people would like to make us aware of?

Young-Eum Lee: Just to mention an addition I would just like to echo Byron's appreciation of Lesley. Thank you.

Byron Holland: Thanks, Young-Eum. Seeing no further ones, I would ask, are there any regional organization updates? Alright. Do we have a mic, a roving mic? Ah, yes, of course we do. Thank you. Barrack?

---

Barrack Otieno: Thank you, Chair. Barrack Otieno from Africa Top Level Domains Organization, for the records. For the regional organizations, I would like to start by noting that cooperation among the four regional top-level domain organization and collaboration is increasing. We had a joint Board Meeting. During this meeting, as has been the practice in the other meetings, and I think today you also that we had a joint presentation done by Patrick Myles, that is just part of what we are doing. Also, on behalf of my colleagues, I wish to say that we -- on Tuesday next week, we'll be launching the survey on the IANA transition, it's a joint survey that we are doing.

We'll do this on the ccTLD wide lists, and I think we are also going to share this information with the other -- all the other stakeholders. And then we also had a meeting between the regional top-level domain organizational managers in the ccNSO executive. We are grateful for that opportunity, and we are hoping that this will be a regular activity to strengthen our collaboration, corporation, and even contribution within the ccNSO.

Lastly, I think on behalf of AFTLD, I wish to say that we have an event coming up from 10<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> November, in Lesotho. And I think LACTLD also has an event. I will ask Sofia to briefly speak about it. Thank you.

Byron Holland: Thank you.

Sofia Zerbino: Thank you, Barrack. Sofia Zerbino from LACTLD. I would like to mention that LACTLD Tech Meeting took place in Sao Paolo during the first week of October. We had nearly 20 registries from that region, and we are going to hold our legal meeting and general assembly and will take place the 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> of November in Aruba. And at this meeting we are going to be discussing the IANA Stewardship transition and ICANN accountability. I did this -- these talks will take place the 7<sup>th</sup>, and we are reaching out to all ccTLDs in our region, whether they are, or not; members from our organization.

Byron Holland: Thank you. November in Aruba, that sounds like a good meeting to go to.

---

Sofia Zerbino: Yeah.

Byron Holland: Certainly better than November in Iowa. Where is Don? APTLD, where are they?

Keith Davidson: Don had sent his apologies.

Byron Holland: Right, his apologies. Thank you. And Peter, is he in the ether somewhere? No?

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: So you're speaking on their behalf? Okay.

Unidentified Recipient: It's Carolina.

Byron Holland: Is Carolina going to say something in addition? No? Okay. Well, we will conclude that all reports delivered. Thank you very much. Staff updates? None? Okay. Thank you all.

Item number 17, working group updates, 17.1, is the CCWG squares, that Becky would have delivered, is there anybody else who can speak to that? Bart? That, for everybody's reference, it's a cross community working group on cross community working groups.

Bart Boswinkel: Yeah. That means that working group had a meeting this morning, during the ccNSO meeting itself, so that was a bit of an issue. So I don't know who of the ccTLDs attended. I couldn't go there as staff support as I've had other priorities.

---

Byron Holland: Okay. Thank you. 17.2; CCWG country names; anybody going to be -- Bart?

Bart Boswinkel: This working group sent out a progress report and, say, on behalf of the leadership I want to read that -- say, for the record, is where they stand in their progress. They did a -- they've -- "We confirm the conclusions on the policy overview and the typology of the study group on country names as well," and now they are starting to delve into the issues.

Byron Holland: Thank you. 17.3, actually we had a presentation at the meeting already, so move on. And then update from the ISTAC.

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Byron Holland: There isn't really a Chair, I've acted as an informal Chair, so I'll provide an informal update, which is this group is the group of folks who are actually on the other respective working groups, there are representatives there on the ICG, on the CCWG IANA, as well as the Vice Chairs and myself. And it's set up to be an exchange of information to make sure that their relative groups are coordinated; aware of what each other is going; aware of any potential timelines or milestones that would be relevant to each other. It's also anticipated that whenever the accountability CWG -- CCWG gets up and running that at that point our nominees, on that working group, would also be part of the ISTAC.

So essentially it's a clearing house for information between all of our members of the respective groups in and around the IANA and accountability issue. And we had our face-to-face meeting on -- it seems so long ago. So I'm going -- that's right, it's the 8-day, 4-day conference. So that provides an update, more or less on that. Are there any questions or concerns? No? Okay.

---

Hearing none; are there any other updates that are working-group-related that we have not covered, that anybody would like to make mention of? Hearing none, I'll consider agenda item 17 covered, thank you. Liaison updates. They are written updates. There are written updates from GNSO and ALAC.

Patrick Myles: Hello. Yes. This is Patrick Myles speaking, for the record. I just wanted to give a little update, that one hour ago in the GNSO there was an adoption of the IATP 4 recommendations, which will go to the Board after public comments. The GNSO also adopted the charter for the CWG on Internet Governance after a long discussion about who is going to be represented on that, whether it be stakeholder groups or constituency level.

They also had a discussion about the accountability drafting team, and there's already some names coming forward for that, which is about four names already. Jonathan Robinson was reelected as Chair, and the Council saw seven incoming counselors. And that's a little update about recent events in GNSO, but there will be a full report tomorrow from me, to the Council.

Byron Holland: Thank you. Lesley, did you have your hand up?

Lesley Cowley: Yeah. I just had a point on ALAC to remind Council members that we have an early-morning (inaudible) with ALAC at 7:30 tomorrow in Olympic.

Byron Holland: Thank you. Any other questions, comments? Okay. I will consider 18 covered. Agenda item number 19 is just the date of the next two meetings. November 20<sup>th</sup> and December 11<sup>th</sup>. And the second item number 19, any other business. Does anybody have any other business, or we are all covered? Kristina?

Kristina Nordstrom: Hello? Yes. I wasn't completely correct when I said all the actions are done, because action 98.05 (ph), I wanted to ask Keith about that if--

---

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Kristina Nordstrom: --the action reads, "Keith Davidson to provide the written updates on the progress of the ICG and to the Council email list, including links to various important documents."

Unidentified Recipient: (Inaudible)

Kristina Nordstrom: It's coming. Thank you.

Byron Holland: Okay. He almost got out clean there. In the future, yes. Okay. Any other business? Thank you, we will consider that closed. So thank you and welcome to our -- I guess this is to our new -- our departing members and their new members. Yes, thank you. And unfortunately Hong could not be here, at this time, no. Anyway I would like to thank Hong for her service, and significant hard work. Hong did a lot of heavy lifting and she will be sorely missed. Anyway, thank you very much to Hong.

And our new NomCom member; is she in the room? No? Jiang (ph)? No.

Unidentified Recipient: He was there earlier.

Byron Holland: He was, I know. I saw him earlier, but okay, well, in absentia, we welcome him to the ccNSO Council.

Keith Davidson: (Inaudible)

---

Byron Holland: Yes. Thank you. Before we go I'd be remiss if I didn't thank the single sponsor that we have for the ccNSO Cocktail last night; Dot.US and NewStar, and certainly Becky Burr. Unfortunately she was definitely missed, but we did have, if you'll note, last night the red drink that was going around. That was actually the Ms. Burr cocktail. So I know I celebrated on her behalf there. Thank you very much to New Star and Dot.US for solely sponsoring. That was certainly a very, very good evening, and very well attended evening.

And with that, I would like to bring this meeting to a close. Can I get somebody to make a motion to close?

Hiro Hotta: I do support (inaudible).

Byron Holland: Hiro; second Keith. Thank you. We'll call the meeting to a close. Thank you, everybody.