3 October 2022

Kevin Blumberg, Chair, Address Supporting Organization (ASO) Address Council
Paul Wilson, Chair, Address Supporting Organization (ASO)
Alejandra Reynoso, Chair, Country Code Names Supporting Organization (ccNSO)
Sebastien Ducos, Chair, Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO)
Jonathan Zuck, Chair, At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC)
Manal Ismail, Chair, Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC)
Fred Baker, Chair, Root Server System Advisory Committee (RSSAC)
Rod Rasmussen, Chair, Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC)

Dear Leadership of the ICANN Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees,

On behalf of the ICANN Board, I am writing to you, the leadership of the ICANN Supporting Organizations (SOs) and Advisory Committees (ACs), to update you on the progress of the Pilot Holistic Review. We encourage you and your groups to review the Public Comment proceeding materials and provide your input on the Draft Terms of Reference (ToR) for the Pilot Holistic Review.

Background
The Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team (ATRT3) recommendation 3.5 called for a new Specific Review, the Holistic Review. On 30 November 2020, the Board approved recommendation 3.5 "subject to prioritization and available resources" and directed the ICANN organization (org) to initiate the first Holistic Review as a pilot to address various information gaps, "pursuant to community-agreed Terms of Reference and relevant elements of the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews." The Pilot Holistic Review was prioritized by the community this year — receiving the highest priority status (P1) — signaling the community's belief that the review is both important and urgent.

Drafting of the Pilot Holistic Review Terms of Reference
In March of 2022, a Pilot Holistic Review ToR Team was formed, consisting of former ATRT3 members and Board members, to draft the ToR with ICANN org's facilitation. The team worked collaboratively over four months to draft a ToR that addresses the information gaps identified by the Board, is in-line with the ATRT3's vision for the Holistic Review and is operationally feasible. A major focus of the ToR team's work was to ensure there are practical assessment mechanisms in place for the evaluations outlined in the ATRT3's Holistic Review objectives.

To develop these assessment mechanisms, the Pilot Holistic Review Team is expected to create a Holistic Review Program under which the principles and criteria for evaluation would be developed specific to each ATRT3 Holistic Review objective. To ensure that the principles and criteria are practical and relevant to the different structures, the Pilot Holistic Review Team will develop them in cooperation with the SOs, ACs, and the Nominating

Committee. In a post-pilot Holistic Review, the SOs, ACs, and the Nominating Committee would then participate via self-assessment, providing each future Holistic Review Team with the objective information necessary to complete the comprehensive evaluation envisioned by the ATRT3.

Following extensive discussion and review, the ToR Team completed their work on the Draft ToR in June 2022 and sent it to the Board, through the Organizational Effectiveness Committee (OEC), for its review. The OEC agreed to post the Draft ToR Public Comment and brief the Board, leading to the opening of the Public Comment proceeding.

Pilot Holistic Review Planning
Planning for the start of the Pilot Holistic Review is underway, including the Public Comment proceeding, resource planning, and the steps thereafter.

Public Comment Proceeding
The Public Comment proceeding will run through 20 October 2022. ICANN org will then analyze the comments and present them to the ICANN Board for consideration through the OEC. Depending on the nature of the comments, the process may include informing the ToR Team of the comments received and seeking clarification on the comments as needed. With support from the Board, the org will make the necessary changes to the Draft ToR before it is finalized. The Board will then coordinate through the OEC to initiate the path forward.

Review Team Appointment
Once the ICANN Board acknowledges the final ToR and the start of the Pilot Holistic Review has been scheduled, the Board will direct the org to open the Call for Volunteers. The SOs and ACs will then select and appoint the Pilot Holistic Review Team members and the Board will designate a Board liaison for the Review Team.

Public Comments
The Public Comment proceeding will extend through 20 October 2022 and there will be several opportunities for you and your groups to get more information. Presentations can be scheduled during ICANN75 if you and your group are interested. To schedule a presentation or briefing from the ICANN org Review Support and Accountability Team, please email rsa-coordinators@icann.org.

Thank you in advance for your input. We look forward to working with you on this important project.

Sincerely,

Tripti Sinha
Chair, ICANN Board of Directors

Resources

Board action on ATRT3 recommendation 3.5: https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2020-11-30-en

Pilot Holistic Review - Pre-Review Roadmap:
https://community.icann.org/display/atrt/Holistic+Review+Pilot+Project

Upcoming Pilot Holistic Review Public Comment Proceeding:
https://www.icann.org/en/public-comment/upcoming-proceedings