

## **Appendix A: Phrasal comparison of RFC 1591 versus ICP 1**

This table presents the phrases from the two documents and compares the wording used. The status column lists whether the statement is accurately reflecting the current facts and procedures utilised in 2009.

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
1	“This memo does not specify an Internet standard of any kind.”	Valid	“[This document] <b>does not</b> reflect any changes in policy affecting the administration of DNS delegations.”	Valid
2	“This memo provides some information on the structure of the names in the Domain Name System (DNS), specifically the top-level domain names; and on the administration of domains.”	Valid	“This document is a summary of current practices of the IANA”; “It is intended to serve as the basis for possible future discussions of policy in this area.”	Valid
3	—	—	“Changes in ICANN/IANA policy will be made following public notice and comment in accordance with the ICANN Bylaws.”	Valid
4	—	—	“[In addition to the details from RFC 1591, this document] includes guidance contained in <i>ccTLD News Memo #1</i> dated October 23, 1997.”	Valid
5	“The Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) is the overall authority for IP Addresses, the Domain Names, and many other parameters, used in the Internet.”	Valid	“The IANA is the overall authority for day-to-day administration of the Internet Domain Name System.”	Valid
6	“The day-to-day responsibility for the assignment of IP Addresses, Autonomous System Numbers, and most top and second level domains are handled by the Internet Registry (IR) and regional registries.”	Invalid	“IANA staff carry out administrative responsibilities for the assignment of IP Addresses, Autonomous System Numbers, Top Level Domains (TLDs) and other unique parameters of the DNS and its protocols.”	Valid
7	“In the Domain Name System (DNS) naming of computers there is a hierarchy of names. The root of system is unnamed.”	Valid	“The DNS structure contains a hierarchy of names. The root, or highest level, of the system is unnamed.”	Valid
8	“There are a set of what are called “top-level domain names” (TLDs).”	Valid	“Top Level Domains (TLDs) are divided into classes based on rules that have evolved over time.”	Valid
9	“These are the generic TLDs (EDU, COM, NET, ORG, GOV, MIL and INT)”	Invalid	“There are a limited number of “generic” top-level domains (gTLDs), which do not have a geographic or country designation.”	Valid
10	“... and the two letter country codes from ISO-3166”	Valid <sup>a</sup>	“Most TLDs have been delegated to individual country managers, whose codes are assigned from a table known as ISO 3166-1”	Valid
11	—	—	“... which is maintained by an agency of the United Nations.”	Invalid
12	—	—	“These are called country-code Top Level Domains, or ccTLDs.”	Valid
13	“It is extremely unlikely that any other TLDs will be created”	Invalid	(removed)	—
14	“Under each TLD may be created a hierarchy of names.”	Valid	(removed)	—

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
15	“Generally, under the generic TLDs the structure is very flat. That is, many organisations are registered directly under the TLD, and any further structure is up to the individual organisations.”	Valid	(removed)	—
16	“In the country TLDs, there is a wide variation in the structure, in some countries the structure is very flat, in others there is substantial structural organisation”	Valid	(removed)	—
17	“In some country domains the second levels are generic categories, in others they are based on political geography, and in still others, organisation names are listed directly under the country code.”	Valid	(removed)	—
18	“The organisation for the US country domain is described in RFC 1480”	Invalid	(removed)	—
19	“Each of the generic TLDs was created for a general category of organisations”	Valid	(removed)	—
20	“The country code domains are each organised by an administrator for that country”	Valid	“Country code domains are each organized by a manager for that country.”	Valid
21	“These administrators may further delegate the management of portions of the naming tree”	Valid	“Responsibility for adoption of procedures and policies for assignment of Second Level Domain Names (SLDs), and lower level hierarchies of names, has been delegated to TLD managers, subject to the policy guidance in this document.”	Valid
22	“These administrators are performing a public service on behalf of the Internet community”	Valid	“These managers are performing a public service on behalf of the Internet community”	Valid
23	“Of these generic domains, five are international in nature, and two are restricted to use by entities in the United States”	Invalid	(removed)	—
24	.COM — “This domain is intended for commercial entities, that is companies.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
25	.COM — “The domain has grown very large and is concern about the administrative load and system performance if the current growth pattern is continued.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
26	.COM — “Consideration is being taken to subdivide the COM domain and only allow future commercial registrations in the subdomains.”	Invalid	(removed)	—

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
27	.EDU — “This domain was original intended for all educational institutions. Many Universities, colleges, schools, educational service organisations, and educational consortia have registered here.”	Valid	(removed)	—
28	.EDU — “More recently a decision has been taken to limit further registrations to 4 year colleges and universities”	Valid	(removed)	—
29	.EDU — “Schools and 2-year colleges will be registered in the country domains.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
30	.NET — “This domain is intended to hold only the computer of network providers, that is the NIC and NOC computers, the administrative computers, and the network node computers.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
31	.NET — “The customers of the network provider would have domain names of their own (not in the NET TLD).”	Invalid	(removed)	—
32	.ORG — “This domain is intended as the miscellaneous TLD for organisations that didn’t fit anywhere else.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
33	.ORG — “Some non-government organisations may fit here.”	Valid	(removed)	—
34	.INT — “The domain is for organizations established by international treaties”	Valid	(removed)	—
35	.INT — “... or international databases”	Invalid	(removed)	—
36	.GOV — “This domain was originally inteded for any kind of government office or agency.”	Valid	(removed)	—
37	.GOV — “More recently a decision was taken to register only agencies of the US Federal government in this domain.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
38	.GOV — “State and local agencies are registered in the country domains.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
39	.MIL — “This domain is used by the US military.”	Valid	(removed)	—
40	.US — “As an example of a country domain, the US domain provides for the registration of all kind of entities in the United States”	Valid	(removed)	—
41	.US — “... on the basis of political geography, that is, a hierarchy of <i>entity-name.locality.state-code.US</i> ”	Invalid	(removed)	—

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
42	.US — “In addition, branches of the US domain are provided within each state for schools, community colleges, state government agencies, councils of governments, libraries, museums, and several other generic types of entities.”	Valid	(removed)	—
43	“To find a contact for a TLD use the “whois” program to access the database on the host rs.internic.net.”	Invalid	“A list of current TLD assignments and names of designated managers can be accessed at <a href="http://www.iana.org/cctld/cctd.htm">http://www.iana.org/cctld/cctd.htm</a> .”	Valid
44	“Append “-dom” to the name of the TLD you are interested in.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
45	“For example “whois -h rs.internic.net us-dom” or “whois -h rs.internic.net edu-dom””	Invalid	(removed)	—
46	“The Internet Assigned Numbers Authority is responsible for overall coordination and management of the Domain Name System (DNS)”	Valid	“As part of its responsibility for the overall coordination and management of the DNS..”	Valid
47	“and especially the delegation of portions of the name space called top-level domains”	Valid	(removed)	—
48	“Most of these top-level domains are two-letter country codes taken from the ISO standard 3166.”	Valid <sup>a</sup>	(removed)	—
49	“A central Internet Registry (IR) has been selected and designated to handled (sic) the bulk of the day-to-day administration of the Domain Name System.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
50	“Applications for new top-level domains (for example, country code domains) are handled by the IR in consultation with IANA.”	Invalid	“... the IANA receives and processes all requests for new TLDs and for changes to existing TLDs”	Invalid
51	“The central IR is INTERNIC.NET”	Invalid	(removed)	—
52	“Second level domains in COM, EDU, ORG, NET and GOV are registered by the Internet Registry at the InterNIC”	Invalid	(removed)	—
53	“The second level domains in the MIL are registered by the DDN registry at NIC.DDN.MIL”	Invalid	(removed)	—
54	“Second level domains in INT registered by the (sic) PVM[ <a href="mailto:ISI.EDU">@</a> ]ISI.EDU”	Invalid	(removed)	—
55	“While all requests for new top-level domains must be sent to InterNIC (at <a href="mailto:hostmaster@internic.net">hostmaster@internic.net</a> )”	Invalid	“This document provides generation information on IANA policy for administering the DNS. Instructions on procedures to be followed in requesting TLD delegations or changes are available on the website at <a href="http://iana.org">iana.org</a> .”	Valid

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
56	"...the regional registries are often enlisted to assist in the administration of the DNS, especially in solving problems with a country administration."	Invalid	(removed)	—
57	"Currently the RIPE NCC is the regional registry for Europe and the APNIC is the regional registry for the Asia-Pacific region, while INTERNIC administers the North America region, and all the as yet undelegated regions"	Invalid	(removed)	—
58	"A new top-level domain is usually created and its management to a "designated manager" all at once"	Invalid	(removed)	—
59	"Most of these same concerns are relevant when a sub-domain is delegated and in general the principles described here apply recursively to all delegations of the Internet DNS name space."	Valid	"In general, the principles described here apply recursively to all delegations of the Internet DNS name space."	Valid
60	"The major concern in selecting a designated manager for a domain is that it be able to carry out the necessary responsibility, and have the ability to do an equitable, just, honest and competent job."	Valid	"Delegation of a new top-level domain requires the completion of a number of procedures, including the identification of a TLD manager with the requisite skills and authority to operate the TLD appropriately."	Valid
61	— <i>(note: phrasing from IANA memo on ccTLDs dated 23 October 1997)</i>	—	"The desires of the government of a country with regard to delegation of a ccTLD are taken very seriously. The IANA will make them a major consideration in any TLD delegation/transfer discussions."	Valid
62	"The key requirement is that for each domain there be a designated manager for supervising that domain's name space."	Valid	"The key requirements is that for each domain there be a designated manager for supervising the domain's name space."	Valid
63	"In the case of top-level domains that are country codes this means that there is a manager that supervises the domain names and operates the domain name system in that country."	Valid	"In the case of ccTLDs, this means that there is a manager that supervises the domain names and operated the domain name system in that country."	Valid
64	"The manager must, of course, be on the Internet."	Valid	(removed)	—
65	"There must be Internet Protocol (IP) connectivity to the nameservers"	Valid	"There must be Internet Protocol (IP) connectivity to the nameservers"	Valid
66	"... and email connectivity to the management and staff of the manager."	Valid	"... and electronic mail connectivity to the entire management, staff, and contacts of the manager."	Valid
67	"There must be an administrative contact and a technical contact for each domain."	Valid	"There must be an administrative contact and a technical contact for each domain."	Valid

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
68	“For top-level domains that are country codes at least the administrative contact must reside in the country involved.”	Valid	“The administrative contact must reside in the country involved for ccTLDs.”	Valid
69	“These designated authorities are trustees for the delegated domain”	Valid	“TLD managers are trustees for the delegated domain”	Valid
70	“... and have a duty to serve the community.”	Valid	“... and have a duty to serve the community”	Valid
71	“The designated manager is the trustee of the top-level domain for both the nation, in the case of a country code,”	Valid	“The designated manager is the trustee of the TLD for both the nation, in the case of ccTLDs,”	Valid
72	“... and the global Internet community”	Valid	“... and the global Internet community.”	Valid
73	“Concerns about “rights” and “ownership” of domains are inappropriate. It is appropriate to be concerned about “responsibilities” and “service” to the community.”	Valid	“Concerns about “rights” and “ownership” of domains are inappropriate. It is appropriate, however, to be concerned about “responsibilities” and “service” to the community.”	Valid
74	“The designated manager must be equitable to all groups in the domain that request domain names.”	Valid	“The designated manager must be equitable and fair to all groups in the domain that request domains.”	Valid
75	“The means that the same rules are applied to all requests, all requests must be processed in a non-discriminatory fashion,”	Valid	“Specifically, the same rules must be applied to all requests and they must be processed in a non-discriminatory fashion.”	Valid
76	“... and academic and commercial (and other) users are treated on an equal basis.”	Valid	“Requests from for-profit and non-profit companies and organisations are to be treated on an equal basis.”	Valid
77	— <i>(note: phrasing from IANA memo on ccTLDs dated 23 October 1997)</i>	—	“The policies and procedures for the use of each TLD must be available for public inspection. Generally these are posted on web pages or made available for file transfer.”	Valid
78	— <i>(note: phrasing from IANA memo on ccTLDs dated 23 October 1997)</i>	—	“While variations in policies and procedures from country to country are expected due to local customs and cultural values, they must be documented and available to interested parties.”	Valid
79	“No bias shall be shown regarding requests that may come from customers of some other business related to the manager e.g. no preferential service for customers of a particular data network provider.”	Valid	“No bias shall be shown regarding requests that may come from customers of some other business related to the TLD manager. For example, no preferential service for customers of a particular data network provider.”	Valid
80	“There can be no requirement that a particular mail system (or other application), protocol, or product be used.”	Valid	“There can be no stipulation that a particular application, protocol, or product be used.”	Valid

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
81	“There are no requirements on subdomains of top-level domains beyond the requirements on higher-level domains themselves. That is, the requirements in this memo are applied recursively.”	Invalid	“There are no requirements for management of subdomains of TLDs, including subdelegations, beyond the requirements for TLDs stated in this document and RFC 1591.”	Invalid
82	“In particular, all subdomains shall be allowed to operate their own domain name servers, providing in them whatever information the subdomain manager sees fit (as long as it is true and correct).”	Valid	“In particular, all subdomains shall be allowed to operate their own domain nameservers, providing in them whatever information the subdomain manager see fit, as long as it is true and correct.”	Valid
83	“Significantly interested parties in the domain should agree that the designated manager is the appropriate party.”	Valid	“Significantly interested parties in the domain should agree that the proposed TLD manager is the appropriate party.”	Valid
84	“The IANA tries to have any contending parties reach agreement among themselves, and generally takes no action to change things unless all the contending parties agree”	Valid	“In the event of a conflict over designation of a TLD manager, the IANA tries to have conflicting parties reach agreement among themselves and generally takes no action unless all contending parties agree.”	Valid
85	“... only in cases where the designated manager has substantially mis-behaved would the IANA step in.”	Valid	(removed)	—
86	— <i>(note: phrasing from IANA memo on ccTLDs dated 23 October 1997)</i>	—	“On a few occasions, the parties involved in proposing delegations or transfers have not been able to reach an agreement and the IANA has been required to resolve the matter. This is usually a long drawn out process, leaving at least one party unhappy, so it is far better when the parties can reach an agreement among themselves.”	Valid
87	“However, it is also appropriate for interested parties to have some voice in selecting the designated manager.”	Valid	“It is appropriate for interested parties to have a voice in the selection of the designated manager.”	Valid
88	“There are two cases where the IANA and the central IR may establish a new top-level domain and delegate only a portion of it”	Invalid	“The IANA may choose to make partial delegations of a TLD when circumstances, such as those in a developing country, so dictate.”	Invalid
89	“(1) there are contending parties that cannot agree”	Invalid	(removed)	—

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
90	“(2) the applying party may not be able to represent or serve the whole country. [This] sometimes arises when a party outside a country is trying to be helpful in getting networking started in a country — this is sometimes called a “proxy” DNS service.”	Valid <sup>a</sup>	“It may also authorise a “proxy” DNS service outside of a developing country as a temporary form of assistance to the creation of Internet connectivity in new areas.”	Valid <sup>a</sup>
91	—	—	“The IANA continues to receive inquiries about delegation of new gTLDs. This is a significant policy issue on which ICANN will conduct a careful study and review based on the established decision making procedures. Information about this study will be disseminated on the website at icann.org.”	Valid <sup>a</sup>
92	“The Internet DNS Names Review Board (IDNB), a committee established by the IANA”	Invalid	(removed)	—
93	“... will act as a review panel for cases in which the parties can not reach agreement among themselves”	Invalid	(removed)	—
94	“The INDB’s decisions will be binding.”	Invalid	(removed)	—
95	“The designated manager must do a satisfactory job of operating the DNS service for the domain. That is, the actual management of the assigning of domain names, delegating subdomains and operating nameservers must be done with technical competence.”	Valid	“The TLD manager must do a satisfactory job of operating the DNS service for the domain. Duties such as the assignment of domain names, delegation of subdomains and operation of nameservers must be done with technical competence.”	Valid
96	“The includes keeping the central IR or other higher-level domain manager advised of the status of the domain”	Valid <sup>a</sup>	“This includes keeping the IANA and other higher-level domain manager advised of the status of the domain”	Valid
97	“... responding to requests in a timely manner”	Valid	“... responding to requests in a timely manner”	Valid
98	“... and operating the database with accuracy, robustness and resilience”	Valid	“... and operating the database with accuracy, robustness and resilience.”	Valid
99	—	—	“Because of its responsibilities for the DNS, the IANA must be granted access to all TLD zones on a continuing basis.”	Invalid
100	“There must be a primary and a secondary nameserver that have IP connectivity to the Internet”	Valid	“There must be a primary and a secondary nameserver that have IP connectivity to the Internet”	Valid
101	“... and can be easily checked for operational status and database accuracy by the IR and the IANA”	Invalid	“.. and can be easily checked via access to zones for operational status and database accuracy by the IANA”	Invalid

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
102	“In cases when there are persistent problems with the proper operation of the domain, the delegation may be revoked, and possibly delegated to another designated manager.”	Valid	“In cases where there is misconduct, or violation of the policies set forth in this document and RFC 1591, or persistent, recurring problems with the proper operation of a domain, the IANA reserved the right to revoke and to redelegate a Top Level Domain to another manager.”	Valid
103	“For any transfer of the designated manager trusteeship from one organisation to another, the higher-level domain manager (the IANA in the case of top-level domains) must receive communications from both the old organisation and the new organisation that assure the IANA that the transfer [is] mutually agreed”	Valid	“For transfer of TLD management from one organisation to another, the higher-level domain manager (the IANA in the case of TLDs), must received communications from both the old organisation and the new organisation that assure the IANA that the transfer is mutually agreed”	Valid
104	“... and that the new organisation understands its responsibilities”	Valid	“... and that the proposed new manager understands its responsibilities.”	Valid
105	“It is also very helpful for the IANA to receive communications from other parties that may be concern or affected by the transfer.”	Valid	“It is also very helpful for the IANA to receive communications from other parties that may be concerned or affected by the transfer”	Valid
106	“In case of a dispute between domain name registrants as to the rights of a particular name, the registration authority shall have no role or responsibility other than to provide the contact information to both parties.”	Invalid	“The IANA has no special requirement for policies to be followed by TLD managers in connection with disputes over rights to domain names other than those stated generally in this document and RFC 1591.”	Valid
107	“The registration of a domain name does not have any trademark status.”	Invalid	“Please note, however, that use of a particular domain name may be subject to applicable laws, including those concerning trademarks and other types of intellectual property.”	Valid
108	“It is up to the requester to be sure he is not violating anyone else’s trademark.”	Valid	(removed)	—
109	“The IANA is not in the business of deciding what is and what is not a country.”	Valid	“The IANA is not in the business of deciding what is and what is not a country.”	Valid
110	“The selection of the ISO 3166 list as the basis for country-code top-level domains was made with the knowledge that ISO has a procedure for determining which entities should be and should not be on that list.”	Valid <sup>a</sup>	“The selection of the ISO 3166-1 list as a basis for country code top-level domains was made with the knowledge that ISO has a procedure for determining which entities should be and should not be on that list.”	Valid
111	—	—	“The primary root zone file is currently located on the A root server”	Invalid
112	—	—	“... which is operated by Network Solutions, Inc. (NSI)”	Invalid
113	—	—	“under a cooperative agreement with the US Government”	Valid

#	RFC 1591 (1994)	Status	ICP 1 (1999)	Status
114	—	—	“Changes to the root zone file are made by NSI according to procedures established under Amendment 11 of that cooperative agreement”	Invalid
<sup>a</sup> The terminology needs to be updated to modern terms, addresses or names.				